

HIGHBURY LOW TRAFFIC NEIGHBOURHOOD TRIALS FLAWED INTERIM MONITORING REPORT

<u>ISLINGTON BOROUGH COUNCIL'S KEY FINDING</u>	<u>KHM'S OBSERVATIONS</u>
<p align="center"><u>1</u></p>  <p>Since through traffic has been prevented in the Highbury PFS trial neighbourhoods, traffic has fallen overall by 43%.</p>	<p>Based on the Report data the correct figure is an average 66% decrease, not 43% (page 26)</p> <p>This is an unsurprising level of traffic reduction, given the 8 new no-access camera filters and the 2 new fixed bollard closures</p> <p>But it's not just <i>"through"</i> traffic that has been <i>"prevented"</i></p>
<p align="center"><u>2</u></p>  <p>There is a mixed picture in terms of the change in motorised traffic volumes on boundary roads. On average, motorised traffic volumes have changed on Hornsey Road by -28%, Holloway Road by -42%, Highbury Grove by -10%, Seven Sisters Road by +7%, St Paul's Road by +15%, Blackstock Road (north) by +16% and Blackstock Road (south) by +49%.</p>	<p>It is not credible that after closing roads within Highbury:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • traffic on some key boundary roads substantially reduced including a 42% decrease in traffic on the A1 (Holloway Road), or that • traffic on other main boundary roads mostly increased only marginally <p>The Report states elsewhere that <i>"Traffic volumes have increased on Holloway Road."</i> (Page 40)</p> <p><u>Examples of data processing errors here include:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the Blackstock Road findings for North and South were mixed up (pages 100 and 102) • the Blackstock Road South count showed a 30% and not a 16% increase (Pages 34 and 102)
<p align="center"><u>3</u></p>  <p>Traffic on Benwell Road has decreased from 11,774 vehicles a day to 932 vehicles (92% decrease).</p>	<p>An unsurprising traffic reduction, given the new no-access camera filter, coupled with Benwell Road's long-established role as a key entry point into Highbury. Most of the traffic has simply been displaced onto Hornsey Road and Holloway Road</p>

<p style="text-align: center;"><u>4</u></p>  <p>Air quality data from within the Highbury neighbourhoods, shows that nitrogen dioxide levels have decreased at all sites since the start of the trials.</p>	<p>The Report actually states:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NO₂ levels in Highbury have increased by 26% since the schemes were implemented (page 54) • there has been a 44% increase at (boundary road) Highbury Grove School (page 61)
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>5</u></p>  <p>On local streets within the neighbourhood, numbers of vehicles speeding fell by 45%.</p>	<p>The Report actually states that on internal roads:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the impact on speeds is “<i>negligible</i>” (page 32) • “<i>Average speeds have fallen by 3%.</i>” (page 32) • the greatest speed decrease is 3.6 mph (page 111)
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>6</u></p>  <p>Cycling has increased by 66% on the internal roads.</p>	<p>Cycling data should have been ‘normalised’ in the Report in the same way that vehicle traffic has been. ⁱ</p> <p>The finding also overlooks adjustment for seasonality to reflect the seasonal differences in cycling levels between November 2020 and May 2021 (25%ⁱⁱ)</p> <p>Based on the Report data the correct figure, after normalisation (23%) and seasonal adjustment (25%), is an increase of only 2%, not 66%ⁱⁱⁱ</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>7</u></p>  <p>Cycling increased at 80% of sites. Highbury Place has seen an 80% increase in cyclists, from 650 to 1,171 cyclists a day. That is an increase of 521 cyclists.</p>	<p>Based on the Report data:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • cycle trips decreased at 60% of sites,^{iv} rather than increasing at 80% of the sites • after normalisation and seasonal adjustment Highbury Place has seen a 32% increase in cycle trips, not an 80% increase^v • cycle trips on boundary roads have decreased by at least 40%^{vi}

<p style="text-align: center;"><u>8</u></p>  <p>No significant impact on anti-social behaviour and crime rates.</p>	<p>No data has been provided in the Report for impact on police response times</p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>9</u></p>  <p>No significant impact on London Fire Brigade response times.</p>	<p>London Fire Brigade data for Islington Upper Street fire station shows^{vii}:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2018 - October 2021: delays attributed to traffic calming measures increased from 27 to 87 a 322% increase • 2020 - October 2021: delays attributed to traffic calming measures averaged 31 seconds, a 7% increase in response time
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>10</u></p>  <p>No data included on impact on Ambulance Service</p>	
<p style="text-align: center;"><u>11</u></p>  <p>No data included on impact on local bus journeys</p>	<p>Average bus speed immediately before the LTN trials^{viii}:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No 19: 8.4 mph • No 4: 8.3mph <p>By September 2021, average bus speeds had decreased to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No 19: 6.8 mph, a 19% reduction in speed • No 4: 6.9 mph, a 17% reduction in speed <p>These speed reductions amount to thousands of lost hours for passengers</p>



No data included on impact on road traffic collisions

Our internal Highbury roads were quite safe pre-LTN inside the Highbury LTN cells area^{ix}:

- **no fatal road collisions since 2005**
- **only 8 serious injury road collisions** over the period 2017 to 2019 inclusive

The same cannot be said of our boundary roads. Here there have been:

- **10 fatal road collisions since 2005**
- **55 serious injury road collisions** over the period 2017 to 2019 inclusive

Our Highbury neighbourhood traffic is now being displaced to these much more dangerous roads

IBC'S ROUTINELY REPEATED LTN JUSTIFICATION

“Traffic on local roads in London – including many parts of Islington – has increased by up to 72%^x in the last ten years.”

This claim is based on an OUT-OF-DATE^{xi} traffic statistic for MINOR ROADS for the WHOLE OF LONDON.

London-wide the currently recognised statistic (following recalculation of minor road benchmarking in 2018 and 2019) is a **58% increase**^{xi} (not 72%)

London-wide: there was a **21% increase** in motor traffic (on all road types) between 2009 and 2019^{xii}

In Islington there was only a **5% increase** in traffic^{xiii} (on all road types) between 2009 and 2019, of which **3% was an increase** in car and taxi traffic

Specifically, DfT counts for local traffic trends in the decade to 2018/2019 showed:

- Upper Street – a **30% decrease**^{xiv} in traffic
- Holloway Road (near the Nag's Head) – a **35% decrease**^{xv} in traffic

The Council's claim of “up to 72%” traffic growth is therefore grossly misleading

The interim monitoring Report is relied on by the PFS team as supportive of the Highbury LTN trials. In fact it is full of omissions and serious mathematical and factual errors. It should be withdrawn.

Keep Highbury Moving

December 2021

ⁱ See any data, e.g Benwell Road page 77 onwards

ⁱⁱ DfT 5-year average daily pedal cycle traffic flow by month in Great Britain (2012 -2016 inclusive) on Urban Roads (Table TRA0404): May at 107.7 and November at 86.1 (plus 25%) with Annual at 100. ONS Traffic Camera Activity Database Analysis for Active Travel in London.

ⁱⁱⁱ See Table 10 (p.46) where the correct percentage difference, calculated from the numbers in the bottom line, is 50% not 66%. Correcting for seasonality (25%) and COVID normalisation (23%) gives a figure of 2%.

^{iv} In Table 10 (p.46), seasonality and COVID normalisation have not been applied to the percentages in column 5. Once these factors are applied, 9/15 roads (60%) show a decrease in cycling.

^v Subtracting 25% (seasonality) and 23% (COVID normalisation) in comparing November 2020 with May 2021, the figure is not 80% but 32%

^{vi} Table 13 page 48. Data recalculated to factor in seasonality and COVID

^{vii} Latest LFB (London Fire Brigade) Mobilisation Database

^{viii} TfL Buses Performance Data; Bus speeds reports Routes 4 and 19 comparing p/c 12/12/20 with p/c 18/09/21 (all day types and all hours reports)

^{ix} Collision data extracted from TfL London Collision maps

^x DfT Traffic Survey Database. Summary Analysis

^{xi} London-wide the currently recognised statistic (following recalculation of minor road benchmarking in 2018 and 2019) is a 58% increase (not 72%.)

^{xii} <https://roadtraffic.dft.gov.uk/regions/6>

^{xiii} <https://roadtraffic.dft.gov.uk/regions/96>

^{xiv} DFT Camera count point 16069 Upper Street, 2010-2019 data

^{xv} DFT Camera count point 56079 Holloway Road, 2008-2018 data